

# Deepening Decentralization: Report of the Evaluation of the District Wide Assistance Project

Edward Jackson, Kathy Durand,  
Denise Beaulieu  
February 11, 2011

## Evaluation Purposes

---

- ❑ Improve management and delivery of DWAP
- ❑ Improve poverty reduction programs based on DWAP model
- ❑ Assess impact on livelihoods and vulnerabilities at household/community levels
- ❑ Prepare lessons to share with DDF and DPs

2

## Data Sources

- ❑ File and document review: Policy, DWAP, region, district
- ❑ Key-person interviews: Accra, region, district  
12 District Assembly case studies
- ❑ Focus groups with women
- ❑ Community assessments (Area Councils, communities with DWAP sub-projects)
- ❑ Sub-project site visits

3

## DWAP Results Chain

**Ultimate Outcome (Impact):** Incidence & severity of poverty in districts of northern Ghana reduced

**Intermediate Outcomes:** 1) Rate of implementation of district initiatives to meet priority needs of DDPs increased  
2) Accountability, transparency and F/M participation in planning, implementation of DDPs are increased  
3) More enabling, gender-sensitive policy and admin. environment for decentralized development programmes

**Immediate Outputs:** 1) Levels of investments in DDP increased  
2) New and reliable information on policy environment & district+ regional capacities produced and disseminated  
3) Regional and district capacities to plan, implement and monitor gender-sensitive DDPs are enhanced

**Activities:** Receipt +disb of funds, sub-projects, audits, comm., C.D., management., M&E, reporting, project management

4



## Overall Findings

---

- ❑ The DWAP model is a success
- ❑ Elements: Hybrid form of project and budget support, timely, bulk release of investment capital, clear guidelines, rewards /punishments for performance, multi-level monitoring, annual auditing, active RPCUs
- ❑ Strengthened DA financial management, procurement, compliance and accountability with DWAP funds
- ❑ Generated important education, health and security outputs and outcomes at the community level
- ❑ Informed the design of the national District Development Facility (DDF)

5



## Northern District Performance

---

- ❑ All “DWAP Districts” fulfilled minimum conditions in second national assessment of organizational performance
- ❑ Northern Districts’ plans are more complete in content and in process than national practices
- ❑ Northern DA financial and progress reporting is more frequent, systematic and of better quality

6

## DWAP Performance on Key Success Factors

Success Factors*	Performance Levels		
	Strong	Moderate	Weak
<b>6. Partnership</b>			
6.1 Active Stakeholder Participation	Strong		
6.2 Understanding of Roles and Responsibilities	Strong		
6.3 Appropriate Authority and Tools			
6.4 Equitable Participation of Women and Men			
6.5 Constraints on the Participation of Women and Girls		Moderate	Weak
<b>7. Appropriateness of Design</b>			
7.1 Meets RBM Standards	Strong		
7.2 Responsiveness to Conditions, Needs or Problems Identified	Strong		
7.3 Ongoing Monitoring Strategies from Risk Analysis in Planning Phase	Strong		
7.4 Experimentation with New Design and Procedures	Strong		
7.5 Recording and Application of Lessons Learned		Moderate	
7.6 Realistic Strategy for Promoting GE Results			Weak
<b>8. Appropriateness of Resource Utilization</b>			
8.1 Sound Financial Policies and Procedures	Strong		
8.2 Sound Contracting Policies and Practices	Strong		
8.3 Capacity of CIDA and GoG to Provide Goods and Services	Strong		
8.4 Good Match Between Needs, Knowledge, Expertise and Skills of All Participants		Moderate	
8.5 Adequate Management of Personnel and Assets	Strong		
8.6 Efforts to Ensure Equal Representation by Men and Women			Weak
<b>9. Informed and Timely Action</b>			
9.1 Effective Assessment of Trends in Project Environment		Moderate	
9.2 Effective Monitoring/Reporting of Internal and External Risks	Strong		
9.3 Adequate Strategies and Practices to Respond to Risk		Moderate	
9.4 Resources Delivered to Effectively Respond to Conditions, Risks, Opportunities and Problems		Moderate	
9.5 Adequate Monitoring of GE Results			
9.6 Adequate Understanding of and Commitment to GE by Stakeholders			Weak

7

## Testimony

- “DWAP has done a lot for the north”
- “DWAP brought new meaning to decentralization”
- “DWAP’s guidelines keep other influences out of the planning process”
- “The monitoring and auditing keeps us on our toes”
- “We would like to see DWAP continue”

8







## Financial Audit

---

- ❑ GAS carries out detailed auditing on DWAP finances and advises on infractions and weak practices
- ❑ Districts now use audit recommendations to manage other funds
- ❑ Proverb: 'If you walk on the sand, you don't see how deep your feet are; the one behind sees.' There is always something to learn from audits

13



## Development Planning

---

- ❑ All Districts have medium term and annual plans
- ❑ Focus of plans is on activities, not results
- ❑ Demand-driven infrastructure development; less emphasis on evidence-based decision-making
- ❑ DWAP has contributed to increased plan implementation through the provision of financial resources, rules and incentives

14







## Training

---

- Training focused on skills and knowledge related to DWAP implementation
- Facilitated District understanding of project requirements
- Generally, however, training is too short and focused on micro level, operational issues
- More training related to strategic issues would be useful and timely

17




## Training

---

- On the job training has been useful, with DA staff learning through the experience of applying policy and guidelines
- Valuable coaching provided
- Peer learning opportunities have been a valuable way to learn from others' experience

18






## Development Results-Education

---

- ❑ Of DWAP's 761 sub-projects, about two-thirds were in the education sector, worth \$20M
- ❑ Education sub-projects were local priorities, could be built rapidly, and were supported by the local Education Department
- ❑ DWAP sub-projects constructed or rehabilitated some 1,100 classrooms, mainly at the primary and junior high levels
- ❑ This enabled 40,000 pupils (40% girls) to benefit from improved learning environment

21



## Development Results-Education

---

- ❑ Helped to boost enrolment, improved retention, while contributing to MDG 2 (universal primary education)
- ❑ There is evidence at DWAP schools that in some cases the gender disparity in enrolment has decreased, especially for primary and junior high school, thus also contributing to MDG 3

22





## Development Results-Health

---

- ❑ Total investment to date of \$3.3M in over 113 sub-projects (Community health compounds, clinics, nurses' quarters)
- ❑ Access to health services has been expanded (e.g. one CHPS compound may treat 1,000 patients per year, 75% of whom are women)

25



## Development Results-Health

---

- ❑ However, Districts with Health Depts. must address other issues
- ❑ Reported cases of certain illnesses (e.g., malaria) are increasing in certain areas
- ❑ Evolving trends and conditions in health require closer monitoring and analysis
- ❑ Availability of sex-disaggregated data in the health sector is limited

26
















## Community Assessments-Approach

- ❑ To assess level and nature of community engagement with DWAP
- ❑ Fieldwork with 12 Area Councils and communities
- ❑ Techniques used included: transect walks, community resource maps, focus groups, community score card, and semi-structured interviews

37

Target Sub -Districts, Communities including Facilities Assessed

District	Sub-District	Communities	Facility
Central Gonja	Kusawgu A/C	Kusawgu	Police & JHS school
Tamale Metro	Tamale north sub metro Council	Kalponhine & Gumani	JHS school & 10 Seater KVIP
Savelugu/ Nanton	Moglaa A/C	Kanshegu	d Z Œ•[ < μ Œ š Œ•
East Mamprusi	Gambaga T/C	Gambaran&Fong	Day Care Centre
Wa Municipal	Wa zonal council	Tampalipani	CHPs compound & Prim. School
Jirapa	Gbare A/C	Gabre	CHPs compound & Prim. School
Lawra	Nandom T/C	Nandom	D P ]•š Œ š } μ Œ š ~ } C
Sissala West	Gwollu T/C	Gwollu	W } o ] ~ d Z Œ•[ Y μ C
Bongo	Beo A/C	Bongo & Beo	Maternity Ward & KVIP
KNEDA	Navrongo T/C	Navrongo	Market
Builsa	Wiaga T/C	Longsa	Day Care Centre & OPD
Bolgatanga	Bolga Zonal Council	Gambibgo	d Z Œ•[ Y μ Œ š X ~ W Œ

## DWAP Performance on Community Engagements

Indicators	Performance Levels			Reasons
	Strong	Moderate	Weak	
Community participation in the DWAP supported projects				Half of the ACs and communities reported they had been involved in <i>sub-project implementation</i> to some degree
Openness and transparency				In terms of openness and transparency, three-quarters of the ACs assessed indicated that they did not know <i>the terms of the contract</i> and the community's entitlements
Quality work on the of sub-projects				Two-thirds of the ACs and community members consulted reported that they were very satisfied with the <i>quality of work</i> on their sub-projects
Usefulness of the sub-projects to the community				All ACs and community members reported that the DWAP sub-projects were <i>useful and beneficial</i> , and improved local living conditions
Environmental dimensions of the sub-projects				In terms of <i>environmental protection</i> , none of the sub-projects visited had planted trees to break the wind or prevent erosion around the DWAP facilities
Operations and Maintenance of the sub-projects				None of the Area Councils or community members reported establishing mechanisms for contributing to the <i>O&amp;M of the facility</i>

## Community Assessments- Lessons

- ❑ Districts with donor projects were able to support some of their communities and Area Councils to prepare CAPs and AAPs
- ❑ Districts that involved communities in sub-project monitoring ensured that contractors did quality work
- ❑ Inadequate consultation by DAs with user Depts. resulted in flawed designs, unfulfilled objectives







## Top Ten Lessons

---

- 9) Officials require strategic leadership skills to navigate and adapt in the face of complexity and change (e.g., education, health, IGF, climate change)
- 10) Newly elected and appointed General Assembly members require training in the sub-project cycle, procurement and financial management standards

45



## Recommendations for DWAP

---

- 1) MOWAC and EPA at the national and regional levels be resourced to participate in DWAP monitoring activities; the GDO be supported to participate in local monitoring
- 2) Support Districts to do more gender analysis of development sectors in the main sections of the MTDPs, instead of addressing gender only in the “vulnerable and excluded” section
- 3) Consultants be contracted to prepare 1) a Gender Impact Assessment Tool to assess and adjust MTDPs and AAPs and 2) a Gender-Responsive Budgeting Tool for MMDAs
- 4) Organize learning events for MMDAs on critical issues and innovations in IGF, education quality, strategic leadership, as well as policy development

46

